

[Submitting Counsel on Signature Page]

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT
ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

This Document Relates to:

ALL ACTIONS

MDL No. 3047

Case No. 4:22-md-03047-YGR

**PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE
MOTION PURSUANT TO CIVIL LOCAL
RULE 7-11 FOR BELLWETHER USER
DATA AND ACCOUNT INFORMATION**

Judge: Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

Magistrate Judge: Hon. Peter H. Kang

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 7-11, Plaintiffs respectfully move the Court for relief as a result of Defendants' refusal to agree to promptly provide Defendant Fact Sheet data and account preservation captures of Personal Injury Bellwether Plaintiffs social media accounts, as stipulated to and as the parties anticipate Judge Kuhl will order in the Judicial Council Coordination Proceedings ("JCCP").

ARGUMENT

Plaintiffs respectfully request the Court to order Defendants to produce preservation captures of Plaintiffs' social media accounts ("snapshots") and Defendant Fact Sheet ("DFS") data for the selected Personal Injury Bellwether Plaintiffs within 14 days of the date of the attached proposed order or of their selection as a bellwether, whichever is later.

1 Judge Kuhl has been overseeing the negotiation and implementation of fact sheets,
 2 discovery mechanisms commonly used in mass litigations to obtain basic case-specific
 3 information. Following implementation of the Plaintiff Fact Sheet (“PFS”) in the JCCP, this
 4 Court adopted the same PFS for use in the MDL. *See* ECF 596. DFSs, like PFSs, are a standard
 5 component of plaintiff-specific discovery in MDLs, and the MDL Plaintiffs participated in the
 6 DFS negotiations with the understanding that like the PFS, the DFS would be adopted in the
 7 MDL once entered by Judge Kuhl in the JCCP. The parties in the JCCP submitted the stipulated
 8 DFS and proposed order for Judge Kuhl’s consideration on May 1, 2024, which will require
 9 Defendants to produce a verified DFS and accompanying data for all identified accounts on or
 10 before May 31, 2024.¹ *See* Stipulated DFS Implementation Order (Ex. A). That data, which will
 11 be produced for upwards of 400 plaintiffs in the JCCP, includes such critical information as the
 12 total time each plaintiff spent on the platform per day, their number of sessions per day, and their
 13 total number of notifications per day. In addition to aiding bellwether selection in the JCCP, it
 14 will serve as basic case-specific discovery akin to the PFSs all Plaintiffs in both litigations must
 15 produce. Negotiations of the DFS took longer than anticipated, and although this Court rejected
 16 Plaintiffs’ request to use this data for bellwether selection in the MDL (*see* CMO No. 12, ECF
 17 728), DFS data remains highly relevant to the twelve MDL personal injury bellwether cases.

18 Defendants have also been ordered to produce in the JCCP snapshots of plaintiffs’
 19 accounts. *See* Minute Order, at 2 (Apr. 24, 2024) (Ex. B). These snapshots are in effect visual
 20 captures of some (though not all) data contained in those accounts (the specifics vary by
 21 Defendant). In the JCCP, Defendants will produce these snapshots for bellwether cases within
 22 two days following their selection. *See id.* Plaintiffs in the MDL originally requested these
 23 snapshots be produced in the MDL during the Parties’ lengthy but ultimately unsuccessful
 24 discussions regarding a proposed preservation order that took place over the last year. Plaintiffs
 25 renewed their request for immediate production of the snapshots for selected bellwethers on May
 26

27 ¹ There is variation in the extent of DFS data Defendants must provide according to the timing of
 28 when a Plaintiff provides the Plaintiff Preservation Form or User Account Confirmation and
 Consent Form, as reflected in the attached Exhibit A, but DFSs must be provided for all Plaintiffs
 who provided Preservation or Confirmation Forms by May 31, 2024.

1 2, 2024.

2 The Parties met and conferred regarding Plaintiffs' request for production of DFS data and
3 snapshots for the selected bellwether plaintiffs on May 8, 2024, and on May 9, 2024, Defendants
4 confirmed they oppose the requested relief. Some Defendants argue that Plaintiffs should be
5 required to propound requests for production of documents for the entire universe of bellwether
6 Plaintiff-specific information they may ultimately seek, and then finalize meet and confer on same, as
7 a prerequisite to obtaining the same basic and highly relevant DFS and snapshot information that the
8 Parties stipulated to, and expect Judge Kuhl to simply order be provided in the JCCP.² But this would
9 only serve to cause unnecessary delays. Plaintiffs' request is simple: Defendants should produce
10 DFS data and the snapshots for identified accounts for the twelve bellwether Plaintiffs without
11 delay. There is no dispute that this information is highly relevant, and it is immaterial that Judge
12 Kuhl is also using this data to aid in JCCP bellwether selection. There is no burden on
13 Defendants, who are already producing this data for a far greater number of JCCP plaintiffs,
14 without any need for prior requests for production of documents and meet and confers on same.
15 The fact is the Defendants are required to produce this data in the JCCP expeditiously, and they
16 should be required to do so for the twelve bellwether Plaintiffs here.

17 CONCLUSION

18 Defendants' refusal to expeditiously produce snapshots and DFS data for the selected
19 Personal Injury Bellwether Plaintiffs is nothing more than an attempt to delay crucial bellwether
20 discovery and the case schedule. The information is highly relevant and proportional to the needs
21 of the case and should be produced within 14 days.

22
23
24
25
26
27
28 ² Given Defendants' refusal to enter into a stipulation like that in the JCCP, in order to preserve
their rights some bellwether Plaintiffs propounded requests for production of documents for DFS
data and snapshots starting on May 10, 2024.

1
2 DATED: May 14, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Lexi J. Hazam

LEXI J. HAZAM

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &
BERNSTEIN, LLP**

275 BATTERY STREET, 29TH FLOOR

SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111-3339

Telephone: 415-956-1000

lhazam@lchb.com

PREVIN WARREN

MOTLEY RICE LLC

401 9th Street NW Suite 630

Washington DC 20004

Telephone: 202-386-9610

pwarren@motleyrice.com

Co-Lead Counsel

CHRISTOPHER A. SEEGER

SEEGER WEISS, LLP

55 CHALLENGER ROAD, 6TH FLOOR

RIDGEFIELD PARK, NJ 07660

Telephone: 973-639-9100

cseeger@seegerweiss.com

Counsel to Co-Lead Counsel

JENNIE LEE ANDERSON

ANDRUS ANDERSON, LLP

155 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 900

SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104

Telephone: 415-986-1400

jennie@andrusanderson.com

Liaison Counsel

EMILY C. JEFFCOTT

MORGAN & MORGAN

633 WEST FIFTH STREET, SUITE 2652

LOS ANGELES, CA 90071

Telephone: 213-787-8590

ejeffcott@forthepeople.com

1 JOSEPH VANZANDT
2 **BEASLEY ALLEN**
3 234 COMMERCE STREET
4 MONTGOMERY, LA 36103
Telephone: 334-269-2343
joseph.vanzandt@beasleyallen.com

5 Federal/State Liaisons

6 MATTHEW BERGMAN
7 GLENN DRAPER
8 **SOCIAL MEDIA VICTIMS LAW CENTER**
9 821 SECOND AVENUE, SUITE 2100
SEATTLE, WA 98104
Telephone: 206-741-4862
matt@socialmediavictims.org
10 glenn@socialmediavictims.org

11 JAMES J. BILSBORROW
12 **WEITZ & LUXENBERG, PC**
13 700 BROADWAY
NEW YORK, NY 10003
Telephone: 212-558-5500
14 jbilborrow@weitzlux.com

15 JAYNE CONROY
16 **SIMMONS HANLY CONROY, LLC**
17 112 MADISON AVE, 7TH FLOOR
NEW YORK, NY 10016
Telephone: 917-882-5522
18 jconroy@simmonsfirm.com

19 ANDRE MURA
20 **GIBBS LAW GROUP, LLP**
21 1111 BROADWAY, SUITE 2100
OAKLAND, CA 94607
Telephone: 510-350-9717
22 amm@classlawgroup.com

23 ALEXANDRA WALSH
24 **WALSH LAW**
25 1050 Connecticut Ave, NW, Suite 500
Washington D.C. 20036
Telephone: 202-780-3014
26 awalsh@alexwalshlaw.com

1 MICHAEL M. WEINKOWITZ
2 **LEVIN SEDRAN & BERMAN, LLP**
3 510 WALNUT STREET
4 SUITE 500
5 PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106
6 Telephone: 215-592-1500
7 mweinkowitz@lfsbalw.com

8 Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Leadership

9 RON AUSTIN
10 **RON AUSTIN LAW**
11 400 MANHATTAN BLVD.
12 HARVEY, LA 70058
13 Telephone: 504-227-8100
14 raustin@ronaustinlaw.com

15 PAIGE BOLDT
16 **WALSH LAW**
17 4 Dominion Drive, Bldg. 3, Suite 100
18 San Antonio, TX 78257
19 Telephone: 210-448-0500
20 PBoldt@alexwalshlaw.com

21 THOMAS P. CARTMELL
22 **WAGSTAFF & CARTMELL LLP**
23 4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300
24 Kansas City, MO 64112
25 Telephone: 816-701-1100
26 tcartmell@wcllp.com

27 SARAH EMERY
28 **HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC**
600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100
LOUISVILLE, KY 40202
Telephone: 859-600-6725
semery@justicestartshere.com

CARRIE GOLDBERG
C.A. GOLDBERG, PLLC
16 Court St.
Brooklyn, NY 11241
Telephone: 646-666-8908
carrie@cagoldberglaw.com

1 RONALD E. JOHNSON, JR.
2 **HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC**
3 600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100
4 LOUISVILLE, KY 40202
Telephone: 859-578-4444
rjohnson@justicestartshere.com

5 SIN-TING MARY LIU
6 **AYLSTOCK WITKIN KREIS &**
7 **OVERHOLTZ, PLLC**
17 EAST MAIN STREET, SUITE 200
PENSACOLA, FL 32502
Telephone: 510-698-9566
mliu@awkolaw.com

9 JAMES MARSH
10 **MARSH LAW FIRM PLLC**
11 31 HUDSON YARDS, 11TH FLOOR
NEW YORK, NY 10001-2170
12 Telephone: 212-372-3030
jamesmarsh@marshlaw.com

13 JOSEPH E. MELTER
14 **KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK**
15 **LLP**
280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD
16 RADNOR, PA 19087
Telephone: 610-667-7706
jmeltzer@ktmc.com

17 HILLARY NAPPI
18 **HACH & ROSE LLP**
19 112 Madison Avenue, 10th Floor
New York, New York 10016
20 Telephone: 212-213-8311
hnappi@hrsclaw.com

21 EMMIE PAULOS
22 **LEVIN PAPANTONIO RAFFERTY**
23 316 SOUTH BAYLEN STREET, SUITE 600
24 PENSACOLA, FL 32502
Telephone: 850-435-7107
epaulos@levinlaw.com

1 RUTH THI RIZKALLA
2 **THE CARLSON LAW FIRM, PC**
3 1500 ROSECRANS AVE., STE. 500
4 MANHATTAN BEACH, CA 90266
Telephone: 415-308-1915
rrizkalla@carlsonattorneys.com

5 ROLAND TELLIS
6 DAVID FERNANDES
7 **BARON & BUDD, P.C.**
8 15910 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 1600
9 Encino, CA 91436
Telephone: 818-839-2333
rtellis@baronbudd.com
dfernandes@baronbudd.com
10 MELISSA YEATES
11 **KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK**
12 **LLP**
13 280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD
RADNOR, PA 19087
Telephone: 610-667-7706
myeates@ktmc.com

14 DIANDRA "FU" DEBROSSE
15 ZIMMERMANN
16 **DICELLO LEVITT**
17 505 20th St North
Suite 1500
18 Birmingham, Alabama 35203
Telephone: 205-855-5700
fu@dicellolevitt.com

19 Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Membership

20 *Attorneys for Individual Plaintiffs*
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

ATTESTATION

I, Lexi J. Hazam, hereby attest, pursuant to N.D. Cal. Civil L.R. 5-1, that the concurrence to the filing of this document has been obtained from each signatory hereto.

DATED: May 14, 2024

/s/ Lexi J. Hazam

Lexi J. Hazam